REPORT FOR THE VILLAGE

VILLAGE OF DOWNERS GROVE

SUBJECT:

Historic Landmark Designation - 4721 Highland Avenue

SUBMITTED BY:

Stan Popovich, AICP
Director of Community Development

SYNOPSIS

A Historic Landmark Designation Resolution has been prepared to designate the house at 4721 Highland Avenue a historic landmark.

STRATEGIC PLAN ALIGNMENT

The goals for the 2017-2019 include Steward of Financial, Environmental and Neighborhood Sustainability.

FISCAL IMPACT

N/A

UPDATE & RECOMMENDATION

This item was discussed at the July 2, 2019 Village Council meeting. Staff recommends approval on the July 9, 2019 Active Agenda.

BACKGROUND

The petitioner is seeking a Historic Landmark Designation for their property 4721 Highland Avenue under criteria 12.302.B.3 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance: representation of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style. The Craftsman architectural style house was constructed circa 1905.

Existing House

The Craftsman Style (derived from the Arts and Crafts Movement of the late 19th century) valued hand craftsmanship, natural materials and simplicity in design/detailing. The use of stone and brick typically had rough cuts and uneven application to look more rustic. Porches were often supported by rustic brick or stone piers. Roofs are low-sloped hipped or gabled roofs with deep overhangs supported by wood brackets and knee-braces. Wood clapboard siding, double hung or casement type windows, and wide front porches were also common. There are many Craftsman homes throughout Downers Grove, particularly in the E.H. Prince Subdivision, and they were promoted as an affordable, middleclass style house.

The home is a one and a half story Craftsman style building with a stone foundation, a basement, and a gabled roof. The home features double-hung windows, a second floor front dormer, a living room bay window, and a front porch with original, neoclassical columns. Other features include wood siding, stone piers, wooden and aluminum storm windows and asphalt shingles.
Analysis of Significance
The proposal complies with the following criteria for Landmark Designation: Section 12.302.A and 12.302.B.3. The house was constructed circa 1905 and is thus over 50 years of age as required by Section 12.302.A. The property must meet one of the criteria noted in 12.302.B and does meet criteria 12.302.B.3 as the house represents the distinguishing characteristics of the Craftsman architectural style.

Public Comment
Three members of the public spoke in support of the petition at the June 19, 2019 ADRB meeting.

ATTACHMENTS
Resolution
Aerial Map
Staff Report with attachments dated June 19, 2019
INITIATED: Petitioner ___________ DATE: July 9, 2019
(Name)

RECOMMENDATION FROM: ___________ FILE REF: ___________
(Board or Department)

NATURE OF ACTION:

- Ordinance
- Resolution
- Motion
- Other

STEPS NEEDED TO IMPLEMENT ACTION:

Motion to Adopt "A RESOLUTION GRANTING HISTORIC LANDMARK DESIGNATION FOR 4721 HIGHLAND AVENUE", as presented.

SUMMARY OF ITEM:

Adoption of the attached resolution shall grant historic landmark designation for 4721 Highland Avenue.

RECORD OF ACTION TAKEN:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

From: cas.19-4721-Hist-Landmark
RESOLUTION NO. ______

A RESOLUTION GRANTING HISTORIC LANDMARK DESIGNATION
FOR 4721 HIGHLAND AVENUE

WHEREAS, the Village of Downers Grove has adopted an Ordinance entitled the
"Historic Preservation Ordinance"; and

WHEREAS, Section 12-301 of the Municipal Code sets forth landmark designation
procedures for areas, properties, buildings, structures, objects and sites; and

WHEREAS, Ted and Andrea Anderson ("Applicant") are the owners of a structure on the
property legally described as follows:

LOT 2 OF WINSLOW AND GIBBS SUBDIVISION OF THE WEST 495 FEET OF
THE SOUTH 330 FEET OF BLOCK 5 OF RICHMOND AND WHITNEY’S
ADDITION TO DOWNERS GROVE, A SUBDIVISION IN SECTIONS 5 AND 8,
TOWNSHIP 38 NORTH, RANGE 11, EAST OF THE THIRD PRINCIPAL
MERIDIAN, IN DUPAGE COUNTY, ILLINOIS.

Commonly known as 4721 Highland Avenue, Downers Grove, IL 60515
PIN 09-08-104-005

WHEREAS, a Craftsman style structure (circa 1905) is on the property; and

WHEREAS, on June 19, 2019, the Architectural Design Review Board conducted a
public hearing in connection with the aforesaid application, after notice of said hearing was duly
given; and

WHEREAS, the Board rendered its decision on the aforesaid application, recommending
that the property located at 4721 Highland Avenue, Downers Grove, Illinois, be granted Historic
Landmark Designation; and

WHEREAS, certain applicable requirements of Section 12-302, Landmark Designation
Criteria, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance relating to the granting of Historic Landmark
Designation have been met.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Village Council of the Village of
Downers Grove, DuPage County, Illinois, as follows:

Section 1. That the recitals contained in the Preamble hereto are incorporated as part of
this Resolution.

Section 2. That the structure located on the property located at 4721 Highland Avenue is
hereby granted Historic Landmark Designation.

Section 3. That the Village Clerk is hereby directed to file a certified copy of this
Resolution in the Office of the DuPage County Recorder of Deeds and is further directed to
transmit a copy of this Resolution to Downers Grove Historical Society and the Applicant.

Section 4. That all resolutions or parts of resolutions in conflict with the provisions of
this Resolution are hereby repealed.
Section 5. That this Resolution shall be in full force and effect from and after its passage as provided by law.

_________________________
Mayor

Passed:
Published:

Attest:________________________
Village Clerk
REQUEST
The petitioners are seeking a Historic Landmark Designation for their home at 4721 Highland Avenue based on the criteria that the property represents the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style.

NOTICE
The application has been filed in conformance with applicable procedural and public notice requirements.

GENERAL INFORMATION

OWNER/APPLICANT:  Ted and Andrea Anderson
4721 Highland Avenue
Downers Grove, IL 60515

PROPERTY INFORMATION

ARCHITECTURAL STYLE: Craftsmen
BUILDING DATE: Circa 1905
HISTORICAL BUILDING USE: Single Family Residence
EXISTING BUILDING USE: Single Family Residence
PROPERTY SIZE: 7,456 Square Feet
PIN: 09-08-104-005

ANALYSIS

SUBMITTALS
This report is based on the following documents, which are on file with the Department of Community Development:

1. Application/Petition for Public Hearing
2. Project Summary
3. Plat of Survey
4. 1927 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map
5. Owner Consent Form
6. Certificate of Acknowledgement Form
7. Historic Landmark Information Form
8. Photographs

PROJECT DESCRIPTION
The petitioners are seeking a Historic Landmark Designation for their property at 4721 Highland Avenue under criteria 12.302.B.3 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance: representation of distinguishing
characteristics of an architectural style. The Craftsman style home was constructed circa 1905.

The Craftsman Style (derived from the Arts and Crafts Movement of the late 19th century) valued hand craftsmanship, natural materials and simplicity in design/detailing. The use of stone and brick typically had rough cuts and uneven application to look more rustic. Porches were often supported by rustic brick or stone piers. Roofs are low-sloped hipped or gabled roofs with deep overhangs supported by wood brackets and knee-braces. Wood clapboard siding, double hung or casement type windows, and wide front porches were also common. There are many Craftsman homes throughout Downers Grove, particularly in the E.H. Prince Subdivision, and they were promoted as an affordable, middleclass style house.

The property at 4721 Highland Avenue is a one and a half story Craftsman style home with a stone foundation, a basement, and a gabled roof. The home features double-hung windows, a Dutch door, a second floor front dormer, a living room bay window, and a front porch with original, neoclassical columns. Other features include wood siding, stone piers, wooden and aluminum storm windows, and asphalt shingles.

The Craftsman Style was popularized by national design plan books in the early 1900s. 4721 Highland Avenue bears strong resemblance to design number 6011 in the Radford’s Artistic Homes 1908 publication. The house is also similar to number 136 in the Gordon Van-Tine Book of Building Plans from 1913.

The home has had a series of owners starting with Robert J. Darnley and family. The current occupants are the applicants, Ted and Andrea Anderson. Their daughter Murial Anderson is an accomplished musician.

**COMPLIANCE WITH HISTORIC PRESERVATION ORDINANCE**

The petitioner has outlined the request in the attached narrative letter and photographs. The petitioner will further address the proposal and justification to support the requested landmark designation at the public hearing.


**Section 12.302.A**
The proposed landmark is either over fifty (50) years old; in whole or in part or is under fifty (50) years of age and possesses exceptional importance such as might be recognized immediately for its reflection of an extraordinary political event or architectural innovation; and

The house was constructed around 1905. This standard is met.

**Section 12.302.B**
That one or more of the following conditions exist:

1. The property has significant value as part of the historic, heritage or cultural characteristics of the community, county, State or Nation;
   This criteria does not apply.

2. The property was owned by a person or persons of historic significance to the community, county, State or Nation;
   This criteria does not apply.
3. **The property represents the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural period, style, type, method of construction or use of indigenous materials;**
   Staff finds the property represents the distinguishing characteristics of a Craftsman style home. This one and a half story building features a gabled roof, a front porch, double-hung windows, an attic made usable by a dormer, stone piers, wooden walls and rustic design elements. This criteria is met.

4. **The property represents notable work of a master builder, designer, architect or artist whose individual work has influenced the development of the community, county, State or Nation;**
   This criteria does not apply.

5. **An area that has yielded or may be likely to yield, information important in history or prehistory.**
   This criteria does not apply.

6. **A source of civic pride or identity for the community.**
   This criteria does not apply.

7. **The property is included in the National Register of Historic Places.**
   This criteria does not apply.

**NEIGHBORHOOD COMMENT**
Staff has not received any neighborhood comments regarding the proposal at this time.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

Staff finds the petition complies with the criteria in Section 12.302 for Landmark Designation. Based on the findings above, staff recommends the Architectural Design Review Board make a positive recommendation to the Village Council for landmark status of 4721 Highland Avenue.

Staff Report Approved By:

__________________________
Stan Popovich, AICP
Director of Community Development
HISTORIC LANDMARK DESIGNATION APPLICATION

Department of Community Development
801 Burlington Avenue – Downers Grove, IL 60515
Phone: 630.434.5515 Fax: 630.434.6873

1. Applicant: Ted Anderson and Andrea Anderson
   Daytime Phone: 630-968-5162
   Mailing Address: 4721 Highland Avenue
   E-Mail Address: tedander@core.com

2. Owner(s) of Record: Thomas Theodore Anderson and Andrea Mae Anderson
   Daytime Phone: 630-968-5162
   Mailing Address: 4721 Highland Avenue
   E-Mail Address: tedander@core.com

3. Owner Consent Required:

   I, Ted Anderson and Andrea Anderson, hereby consent, as the owner of the property located at
   4721 Highland Avenue (PIN # 09-08-104-005), that the Village of Downers Grove
   may designate my property as a Historic Landmark subject to the rules and regulations of the
   Downers Grove Historic Preservation Ordinance.

   Ted Anderson
   Andrea Anderson
   Printed Name of Owner(s)
   Signature of Owner(s)
   Date

4. Applicant is: ☑ Owner  ☐ Attorney  ☐ Other Agent (please specify)
   (Note: A letter of authorization from the owner(s) of record must be attached if the owner is not the applicant)

5. Address/Location of Subject Property: 4721 Highland Avenue

6. Property Index Number(s) of Subject Property: 09-08-104-005

I hereby certify that the above statements and all accompanying statements and drawings are true and correct to the
best of my knowledge. I hereby consent to the entry in or upon the premises described in this application by any
authorized official of the Village of Downers Grove for the purpose of securing information, posting, maintaining and
removing such notices as may be required by law.

Andrea Mae Anderson  5-13-2019
Applicant Signature
Date

Please note that advertisement of proposed projects prior to Village approval in no way creates an obligation for Village approval.
Any advance promotion of a project is done at the risk of the petitioner.
Historic Landmark Information Form

Property Address 4721 Highland Avenue

Date of Construction circa 1904

Architectural Style Craftsman Cottage

Architect (if known) Unknown

Number of Stories 1.5 Basement (Y/N) Y

Foundation Materials (Concrete, Concrete Block, Wood, Stone, Brick, N/A)
Stone

Exterior Wall Materials (Concrete, Wood, Stone, Brick, Vinyl, Other, N/A)
Wood

Roof Type (Gabled, Cross-Gabled, Hipped, Hipped-Gable, Shed, Gambrel, Flat, Other, N/A)
Gabled

Roof Materials (Metal, Wood Shingle, Wood Shake, Composition, Slate, Tile, Other, N/A)
Asphalt shingles

Window Type (Double-Hung, Awning, Casement, Hopper, Other, N/A)
Double-Hung

Window Materials (Wood, Aluminum, Vinyl, Other, N/A)
Wood with aluminum storm windows.

Door Type (Panel, Flush, Transom, N/A) and Materials (Wood, Metal, Glass, N/A)
Dutch Door

Other significant exterior architectural features (Accessory Structures, Arches, Porches, Towers, Brick Course, etc.)
Second floor front dormer, front porch with original columns that are neoclassical in style; living room bay, shingles in the gables
Certificate of Acknowledgement Form

I, Ted and Andrea Anderson, attest, as the owner(s) of the property located at
4721 Highland Avenue (PIN # 09-08-104-005), that I have received
a copy of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and understand its requirements. I understand that if my
property is designated a Historic Landmark, the property will be recorded as such with the County
Recorder. I understand that I, or any future owners of the property, will require a Certificate of
 Appropriateness in order to undertake any minor or major exterior modifications as listed under Section
12.502 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Attest: Ted and Andrea Anderson
Printed Name of Owner

Signature of Owner

5-13-2019
Date

File Number (Village Use Only)
Historic Landmark Designation
Project Summary/Narrative Letter

Property Address: 4721 Highland Avenue
Applicants: Ted and Andrea Anderson

Legal Description
Lot 2 of Winslow and Gibbs Subdivision of the West 495 feet of the South 330 feet of Block 5 of Richmond and Whitney’s Addition to Downers Grove, a Subdivision in Sections 5 and 8, Township 38 North, Range 11, East of the Third Principal Meridian, in DuPage County, Illinois.

History of the Property and Homeowners

4721 Highland Avenue is part of the Winslow and Gibbs Subdivision. Robert J. Darnley purchased the property in 1904 from Emily G. Gibbs for a sum of $700. R.J. Darnley is listed in the 1905 Downers Grove Telephone Directory as residing at 151 Highland, the address prior to 1927. His wife was Gertrude F. Darnley and the two are buried at Oak Hill Cemetery with their infant son, Robert J., Jr. According to the 1910 U.S. Census, Robert Darnley was a Chief Clerk at the Railroad Office. In the 1940 U.S. Census, his wife Gertrude, now residing at 4925 Highland, is working as a clerk for the railroad, with her daughter, Dorothy Darnley, aged 22. According to a title search prepared by the applicant’s real estate agent, Darnley sold the property to Chester B. Reed in 1912. This is supported by tax records, with Chester B. Reed paying the 1912 property taxes (in 1913).

The applicants purchased the home in 1967 and raised their family here. Their daughter, Muriel Anderson, is a well-known musician, specializing in fingerstyle guitar and harp guitar. She has performed and recorded with Chet Atkins, Les Paul, Victor Wooten, and the Nashville Chamber Orchestra. She is the first woman to win the National Fingerstyle Guitar Championship. Her music appears in Woody Allen’s “Vicky Cristina Barcelona,” and accompanied astronauts on the Discovery Space Shuttle. (https://murielanderson.com/press/bio/) Every year, she returns to her hometown for a special Thanksgiving concert held at Downers Grove North High School. She lived in the house from 1967 until completing her studies at DePaul University in the mid-1980s.

The exterior of this one and a half story frame cottage is original, with a stone foundation and double hung windows. The porch is original with columns that add a Neoclassical touch to the Craftsman Cottage. A bay is located on the south side of the house. The roof is gabled with a front dormer. The gables include decorative shingles. Although no significant marks or numbers were found on the basement joists, this home closely resembles Gordon-Van Tine Co. Model No. 126, as well as Radford Design No. 6011 from 1908.
4721 Highland Avenue.

From Radford's Artistic Homes, 1908.

From Gordon Van-Tine Book of Building Plans, 1913.
How the Proposed Designation meets the Landmark Designation Criteria

The home meets the Landmark Designation Criteria as follows:

A. "The proposed landmark is either over fifty (50) years old, in whole or in part."

The house is built circa 1904, according to the deed signed 1 September 1904 from the grantor, Emily G. Gibbs, to grantee, Robert J. Darnley, and supported by property tax records. The house is currently 115 years old. This criterion is met.

B. That one or more of the following conditions exist:

3. The property represents the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural period, style, type, method of construction or use of indigenous materials."

This house is a unique one and one-half story Craftsman Cottage, very similar to those sold through Gordon Van Tine Co. and Sears Roebuck and Co. Described in the Gordon Van Tine Co. catalogue as "a remarkably comfortable little house .... This is a house out of the ordinary—one of those you have been looking for." It is simple and symmetrical, with a gabled roof. The living room contains a bay window. The wood siding is original, as well as most of the wood, double hung windows. The foundation is made of stone. The cottage style is Craftsman, with a touch of Neoclassical Revival with the Greek style columns on the front porch. The use of shingles (see photographs of the gables, painted a rust color) is a typical feature of a Craftsman style house. This criterion is met.
Photographs:

Photo #1: Front elevation facing west, January 11, 2019.
Photo #2: Side elevation facing north, April 2, 2019.
Photo #3: Side elevation facing south, April 2, 2019,
Photo #4: Real estate listing, circa 1967.
Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, showing location and plan layout of 4721 Highland in 1927.
PUBLIC HEARING FILE 19-ADR-0002: A petition seeking an Historic Landmark Designation for the property commonly known as 4721 Highland Avenue, Downers Grove, IL (PIN 09-08-104-005). Ted and Andrea Anderson, Petitioners and Owners.

Staff Presentation:

Ms. Gabriella Baldassari, Development Planner for the Village of Downers Grove, stated that the property is located on the northeast corner of Prairie and Highland. The petitioner is seeking landmark designation for their property representing the Craftsman style of architecture. The application was shared with the Illinois State Historic Preservation Office, which supported that the home is a great example of this particular architectural style. The house was built circa 1905, and Ms. Baldassari displayed a photograph of the house and reviewed the architectural features of the Craftsman style home. It has a gabled roof, bay window, second floor dormer, wide porch, double-hung windows as well as asphalt shingles and rough-cut stone that add to the rustic appeal of a Craftsman home.

Ms. Baldassari stated that based upon the findings as stated in Staff’s Report dated June 19, 2019 Staff finds the petition complies with the criteria in Section 12.302 for Landmark Designation and recommends a positive recommendation from the Board to the Village Council.

Ms. Chalberg said she is in favor of this request, but questioned the wording regarding when the home was built and the potential misclassification as a kit home. She said the home is recorded as being built in 1905, however the kit home display shown with the application has a later date. Her concern was whether that would effect that the home is seen as a kit home, since it is not a kit home.

Ch. Davenport said he thought the inclusion of the kit home reference was just a further way of describing the Craftsman style and the type of home it is.

Mr. Larson said the kit homes started with a catalog of homes, like Sears. The page shows the cost for plans, etc. It reflects that it comes from a group of homes that people can choose.

Ms. Chalberg replied that this particular home, however, is not a kit home.

Mr. Larson said looking at the criteria, the question is whether the home is representative of a style of a certain period. The kit reference shows that this is a style that was common at that time.

There being no additional comments at this time, Ch. Davenport asked the Petitioner if they wanted to add any information.

Petitioner’s Presentation:
Mr. Ted (Thomas) Anderson, owner and petitioner of the subject property, said they are interested in preserving the character of Downers Grove and the community as a whole. Their home is a part of that community and they believe they should preserve the history of the community as long as possible. Neighbors have encouraged them to seek the landmark designation. There has been no change to the front of the house, although there are a few differences from the original house. They now have a Dutch door, which was not part of the original construction, and changes were made to a window in the interior stairway area. Most of the windows are original, and they hope to maintain the home. The Andersons have four children who are concerned about potentially selling the landmarked house in the future.

Ch. Davenport noted that additional criteria for historic preservation can also relate to who lived in the home. He said that Muriel Anderson is an accomplished musician who actually grew up in that home, and that could be a criteria later added to this. He then opened the meeting to public comment.

1. Irene Hogstrom of 1232 Gilbert Avenue said when she began researching this home it was difficult to find examples of the type of architecture. She was responsible for including the kit home reference, but there was nothing in their search to indicate that this particular home was a kit home. She added that she first noticed this home several years ago due to the unique architecture and native landscaping. Ms. Hogstrum supported the Andersons in their desire to landmark the home.

2. Christine Martin of 701 Maple Avenue said she has always admired this home when driving down Highland Avenue. She commented that she appreciated them landmarking their home to preserve the neighborhood. There are many homes on Highland that are intact, and she hopes that by the Andersons stepping forward to landmark it spreads throughout the neighborhood.

3. Amy Gassen of 5320 Benton Avenue said this is a great example of a Craftsman style home. She agrees with Mr. Anderson’s comment to preserve the neighborhood as well. She thanked the Andersons for making this decision.

Ms. Chalberg responded to Mr. Anderson’s comment about resale. She said that there are no guarantees that any home will sell, as it depends upon the market. Because the Andersons have taken the step to preserve the neighborhood, they have gone a long ways to keep the resale values intact in their neighborhood by landmarking their home.

There being no additional comments, Ch. Davenport closed the public portion of the meeting.

**Board’s Deliberation:**

Mr. Lerner said that Muriel Anderson being raised in that home is a great point to consider as well. He said he saw an article in an older Toronto magazine about historic preservation, and he quoted a line: “Historic buildings are physical links to our past.” The article went on to say that it’s not just about saving bricks, but about saving the
layers of information about our lives and those of our ancestors. He thinks preserving these homes is desirable.

Mr. Larson said he thought the information in the packet showed the home as a great example of the Craftsman Cottage style, and an example of how simplicity of lines and design can be beautiful. The home contributes to the character of the neighborhood and is a significant asset to it. He commented that the landscaping in front of the home is exceptional. The Andersons put in permeable paving in their driveway many years before it became fashionable.

Ch. Davenport thanked the petitioners for leading the way and setting an example. There is a reason why people want to live on that street, and that includes the special character of the neighborhood, which this home helps to preserve. He then called for a Motion.

Mr. Larson moved that based on Staff's findings the Architectural Design Review Board make a positive recommendation to the Village Council for landmark status of 4721 Highland Avenue. Mr. Lerner seconded the Motion.

AYES: Mr. Larson, Mr. Lerner, Ms. Chalberg, Ch. Davenport
NAYS: None

The Motion passed unanimously.