VILLAGE OF DOWNERS GROVE
Report for the Village Council Meeting
3/21/2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUBJECT:</th>
<th>SUBMITTED BY:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Historic Landmark - 4836 Middaugh Avenue</td>
<td>Stan Popovich, AICP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Director of Community Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SYNOPSIS
A Historic Landmark Designation Resolution has been prepared to designate the house at 4836 Middaugh Avenue a historic landmark.

STRATEGIC PLAN ALIGNMENT
The goals for 2015-2017 include Steward of Financial, Environmental and Neighborhood Sustainability.

FISCAL IMPACT
N/A

UPDATE & RECOMMENDATION
This item was discussed at the March 14, 2017 Village Council meeting. Staff recommends approval at the March 21, 2017 Village Council meeting.

BACKGROUND
The petitioners are seeking a Historic Landmark Designation for their property at 4836 Middaugh Avenue under criteria 12.302.B.3 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance: representation of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style, the Gabled-Ell style.

Existing House
Gabled-Ell houses were a common vernacular building form throughout the mid to late 1880s and feature a dominant open gable elevation facing the street. This form was typically used for working and middle-class homes and could feature Greek Revival, Italianate or Queen Anne detailing and ornamentation. Queen Anne characteristics would include: steeply pitched asymmetrical roofs, wood clapboard, bandboard or wood trim bargeboards, elaborate porches with spindlwork and other ornamentation. The Gabled-Ell also features an entrance porch on one side of the house along the street. This building form can mostly be found in E.H. Prince’s Subdivision.

The property at 4836 Middaugh Avenue is on a corner lot with a dominant gable facing each street. The projecting L-shaped cross-gables are a distinguishing feature and indicate the footprint of the original building. The wrap-around screened porch is not original (circa 1900) and encloses the wood panel front door. The house is built on a foundation of stone. All the windows are original and are wood and double...
hung. Interior features include the original fireplace with decorative tile. The flooring and doors are also original.

The Chilvers family lived in the structure for five years. Mr. Chilvers was on the very first North Side Volunteer Fire Department in 1894.

**Analysis of Significance**
The proposal complies with the following criteria for Landmark Designation: Section 12.302.A and 12.302.B.3. The house was constructed circa 1893 and is thus over 50 years of age as required by Section 12.302.A. The property must meet one of the criteria noted in 12.302.B and does meet criteria 12.302.B.3 as the house represents the distinguishing characteristics of a Gabled-Ell with Queen Anne characteristics. The cross-gables project on both street elevations, there are the original wood windows that are double-hung, wood bargeboard, wood scales, and other original exterior and interior features as described above in the project description.

**Analysis of Significance**
Four members of the public spoke in support of the petition at the February 15, 2017 ADRB meeting.

**ATTACHMENTS**
Resolution
Aerial Map
Staff Report with attachments dated February 15, 2017
Minutes of the Architectural Design Review Board Hearing dated February 15, 2017
VILLAGE OF DOWNERS GROVE
COUNCIL ACTION SUMMARY

INITIATED: Petitioner (Name) DATE: March 21, 2017

RECOMMENDATION FROM: (Board or Department) FILE REF: ____________

NATURE OF ACTION:

- Ordinance
X Resolution
- Motion
- Other

STEPS NEEDED TO IMPLEMENT ACTION:

Motion to Adopt "A RESOLUTION GRANTING HISTORIC LANDMARK DESIGNATION FOR 4836 MIDDAUGH AVENUE", as presented.

SUMMARY OF ITEM:

Adoption of the attached resolution shall grant historic landmark designation for 4836 Middaugh Avenue.

RECORD OF ACTION TAKEN:

__________________________________________________________________________

__________________________________________________________________________

__________________________________________________________________________
RESOLUTION NO. ______

A RESOLUTION GRANTING HISTORIC LANDMARK DESIGNATION
FOR 4836 MIDDAAUGH AVENUE

WHEREAS, the Village of Downers Grove has adopted an Ordinance entitled the "Historic Preservation Ordinance"; and

WHEREAS, Section 12-301 of the Municipal Code sets forth landmark designation procedures for areas, properties, buildings, structures, objects and sites; and

WHEREAS, Patrick & Chris Gummi Sexton ("Applicant") are the owners of certain property legally described as follows:

LOT 10 IN BLOCK 39 IN E.H. PRINCE AND COMPANY’S THIRD ADDITION TO DOWNERS GROVE, BEING A SUBDIVISION IN THE NORTHEAST QUARTER OF SECTION 7, TOWNSHIP 38 NORTH, RANGE 11 EAST OF THE THIRD PRINCIPAL MERIDIAN, ACCORDING TO THE PLAT THEREOF RECORDED MARCH 23, 1892 AS DOCUMENT NO. 47981, IN DUPAGE COUNTY, ILLINOIS.

Commonly known as: 4836 Middaugh Avenue, Downers Grove, IL 60515 (PIN 09-07-211-015)

WHEREAS, an 1893 Gabled-Ell structure with Queen Anne Characteristics is on the property; and

WHEREAS, on February 15, 2017, the Architectural Design Review Board conducted a public hearing in connection with the aforesaid application, after notice of said hearing was duly given; and

WHEREAS, the Board rendered its decision on the aforesaid application, recommending that the property located at 4836 Middaugh Avenue, Downers Grove, Illinois, be granted Historic Landmark Designation; and

WHEREAS, certain applicable requirements of Section 12-302, Landmark Designation Criteria, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance relating to the granting of Historic Landmark Designation have been met.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Village Council of the Village of Downers Grove, DuPage County, Illinois, as follows:

Section 1. That the recitals contained in the Preamble hereto are incorporated as part of this Resolution.

Section 2. That the structure located on the property located at 4836 Middaugh Avenue is hereby granted Historic Landmark Designation.

Section 3. That the Village Clerk is hereby directed to file a certified copy of this Resolution in the Office of the DuPage County Recorder of Deeds and is further directed to transmit a copy of this Resolution to Downers Grove Historical Society and the Applicant.
Section 4. That all resolutions or parts of resolutions in conflict with the provisions of this Resolution are hereby repealed.

Section 5. That this Resolution shall be in full force and effect from and after its passage as provided by law.

_________________________
Mayor

Passed:
Published:

Attest: ____________________________
Village Clerk
## SUBJECT:  
17-ADR-0002  
4836 Middaugh Avenue

## TYPE:  
Designation of a Historic Landmark

## SUBMITTED BY:  
Scott Williams  
Planner

### REQUEST
The petitioners are seeking a Historic Landmark Designation for their home at 4836 Middaugh Avenue based on the criteria that the property represents the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style.

### NOTICE
The application has been filed in conformance with applicable procedural and public notice requirements.

### GENERAL INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OWNER/</th>
<th>Patrick and Chris Gumm Sexton</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APPLICANT</td>
<td>4836 Middaugh Avenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Downers Grove, IL 60515</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PROPERTY INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARCHITECTURAL STYLE:</th>
<th>Gabled-Ell with Queen Anne Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BUILDING DATE:</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HISTORICAL BUILDING USE:</td>
<td>Single Family Residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXISTING BUILDING USE:</td>
<td>Single Family Residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROPERTY SIZE:</td>
<td>6600 square feet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIN:</td>
<td>09-07-211-015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ANALYSIS

#### SUBMITTALS
This report is based on the following documents, which are on file with the Department of Community Development:

1. Application/Petition for Public Hearing  
2. Project Summary  
3. Plat of Survey  
4. Owner Consent Form  
5. Certificate of Acknowledgement Form  
6. Historic Landmark Information Form  
7. Photographs  
8. House Timeline  
9. Biography
PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The petitioners are seeking a Historic Landmark Designation for their property at 4836 Middaugh Avenue under criteria 12.302.B.3 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance: representation of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style. The two-story Gabled-Ell with Queen Anne characteristics was constructed in 1893 and was first occupied by the Chilvers family.

Gabled-Ell houses were a common vernacular building form throughout the mid-to late-1880s and features a dominant open gable elevation facing the street. This form was typically used for working and middle-class homes and could feature Greek Revival, Italianate or Queen Anne detailing and ornamentation. Queen Anne characteristics would include: steeply pitched asymmetrical roofs, wood clapboard, bandboard or wood trim bargeboards, elaborate porches with spindlework and other ornamentation. The Gabled-Ell also features an entrance porch on one side of the house along the street. This building form can mostly be found in E.H. Prince’s Subdivision.

The property at 4836 Middaugh Avenue is on a corner lot with a dominant gable facing each street. The projecting L-shaped cross-gables are a distinguishing feature and indicate the footprint of the original building. The wrap-around screened porch is not original (circa 1900) and encloses the wood panel front door. The house is built on a foundation of stone. All the windows are original and are wood and double hung. Interior features includes the original fireplace with decorative tile. The flooring and doors are also original. A rear addition constructed circa 1930 does not impact the historic features or integrity of this Gabled-Ell.

The Chilvers family lived in the structure for five years. Mr. Chilvers was on the very first North Side Volunteer Fire Department in 1894. In 1895, he became a Village Trustee who made a motion to replace a policeman requesting a pay raise. Mr. Chilvers also fell victim to a “Gold Finding Machine.”

COMPLIANCE WITH HISTORIC PRESERVATION ORDINANCE

The petitioner has outlined the request in the attached narrative letter and photographs. The petitioner will further address the proposal and justification to support the requested landmark designation at the public hearing.

Landmark designations require evaluation based on Section 12.302 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Landmark Designation Criteria. Staff finds the request complies with Section 12.302A and Section 12.302.B, as described below.

Section 12.302.A.

The proposed landmark is either over fifty (50) years old; in whole or in part or is under fifty (50) years of age and possesses exceptional importance such as might be recognized immediately for its reflection of an extraordinary political event or architectural innovation; and

The house was constructed in 1893. This standard is met.

Section 12.302.B

That one or more of the following conditions exist:

1. The property has significant value as part of the historic, heritage or cultural characteristics of the community, county, State or Nation;
   This criteria does not apply.

2. The property was owned by a person or persons of historic significance to the community, county, State or Nation;
   This criteria does not apply.
3. The property represents the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural period, style, type, method of construction or use of indigenous materials;  
   Staff finds the property represents the distinguishing characteristics of the Gabled-Ell vernacular form with Queen Anne features. These features include cross-gables, original windows, bargeboard, and original interior features. This criteria is met.

4. The property represents notable work of a master builder, designer, architect or artist whose individual work has influenced the development of the community, county, State or Nation;  
   This criteria does not apply.

5. An area that has yielded or may be likely to yield, information important in history or prehistory.  
   This criteria does not apply.

6. A source of civic pride or identity for the community.  
   This criteria does not apply.

7. The property is included in the National Register of Historic Places. 
   This criteria does not apply.

**NEIGHBORHOOD COMMENT**  
Staff has not received any neighborhood comments regarding the proposal at this time.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

Staff finds the petition complies with the criteria in Section 12.302 for Landmark Designation. Based on the findings above, staff recommends the Architectural Design Review Board make a positive recommendation to the Village Council for landmark status of 4836 Middaugh Avenue.

Staff Report Approved By:

Stan Popovich, AICP  
Director of Community Development
Historic Landmark Information Form

Property Address: 4836 Maddaugh

Date of Construction: 1893

Architectural Style: Queen Anne

Architect (if known): 

Number of Stories: 2  Basement (Y/N): Y

Foundation Materials (Concrete, Concrete Block, Wood, Stone, Brick, N/A): Stone

Exterior Wall Materials (Concrete, Wood, Stone, Brick, Vinyl, Other, N/A): Vinyl

Roof Type (Gabled, Cross-Gabled, Hipped, Hipped-Gable, Shed, Gambrel, Flat, Other, N/A): Cross-Gable

Roof Materials (Metal, Wood Shingle, Wood Shake, Composition, Slate, Tile, Other, N/A): Shingle

Window Type (Double-Hung, Awning, Casement, Hopper, Other, N/A): Double-Hung

Window Materials (Wood, Aluminum, Vinyl, Other, N/A): Wood

Door Type (Panel, Flush, Transom, N/A) and Materials (Wood, Metal, Glass, N/A): Panel Wood

Other significant exterior architectural features (Accessory Structures, Arches, Porches, Towers, Brick Course, etc.): Porch
1861 James William Chilvers is born to John and Alice Chilvers of Downers Grove (1860 Census)

1870 Is at School in Downers Grove (1870 Census)

1874 Atlas Map of Chilvers Farm

1880 Still with parents at farm (1880 census)

1883 Married Hattie Lucy Derby in Will County (Ancestry.com)

1884 Roy is born at Barbers Corners which is now 53 and Boughton (obituary)

1886 Edith is born

1892 Ella Chilvers (sister in law) buys Lot 10 Block 39

1893 House is built per tax records to James and Hattie Chilvers

1894 J. Chilvers is serving on first northside fire fighters (Downers Grove 1832-1982)

1895 May 6, he is voted in as Village Trustee (Per Village of Downers Grove Clerk Alice Holdon,)

Policeman Hoffert decided in 1895 that he needed a raise in pay since several of the merchants had stopped paying their subscription. He presented his request to the Village Board and was shocked when Mr. Chilvers made a motion which was seconded by Mr. Moss that Officer Hoffert be discharged if his salary was insufficient and another officer be employed in his place. After a little thought he withdrew his application for salary increase. (Page 242 Downers Grove 1832-1982)

1895 Says he has a new store on Main Street (1895 Republican Newspaper)

1898 Middaugh home is sold to C. Arthur Brown (owned 3 months sold to Minnie Lundell whom did not live there. Lundells lived in Ravenswood area per ancestry.com Husband died in 1903)

1900 Chilvers is living on Saratoga occupation a merchant. (1900 Census)
1903 Home is bought by Albert Winter whom is said to have helped build train depot. He is listed as a railroad contractor. Letters from family members acclaim to this as well. We believe Winter rented the home from 1898-1903. We speculate this due to the fact that family remembers them being there pre 1900.

1910-1930 James Chilvers lived in Downers Grove until his death in 1930 from Bright's Disease.

1910-1940 Albert Winter and his family lived at 4836 Middaugh until the death of his wife in 1944. The family resided in the home for 46 years. Albert winter is a relation to Jack Winter of the Reporter. Both his sons served in WWI.
CHILVERS HOUSE

In 1861 James William Chilvers was born to John and Alice Chilvers whom came to Downers Grove from Sofolk, England around 1850. Their son John was born in Downers Grove in 1859. The Chilvers family farm was located south of downtown in Downers Grove Township. In 1883, James married Hattie Lucy Derby in Will County.

The couple lived in Barber’s Corners (Route 53 and Boughton) where their children were born. They moved into the downtown area in 1892. They built their home at 4836 Middaugh and remained there until 1898.

In 1894, James joined the first ever volunteer Fire Fighters Department. On May 6, 1895 he was sworn in as a Village Trustee. A story goes that Officer Hoffert decided that he needed a pay raise since several merchants stopped paying their subscription. Mr Chilvers said he could resign his position instead. Officer Hoffert declined his pay raise.

It was also in 1895 that Mr. Chilvers was in the Republican newspaper. He helped test a so called “gold finder” He hid $250 in gold in his store and low and behold the bottle with an attached string found the gold “speedily”. During this time he owned a business on Main Street.

Mr. Chilvers was mainly a contractor for buildings. He built various homes in Downers Grove. He lived here until his death in 1930 from Brights Disease.
Original House:

Side-by-Side Comparison
The most precious gift I own.
Grandpa, Grandma, Bob, Albert.
Dad looks about 1910.
Vera on right.

Mother and Father in Downers - I think (WINTERS) at , at "".

Terribly in love in this photo. Aren't they lovely?
The Downers Yappee
Circa 1918?

Dad at home on Wade St.
Wade - no houses across street

How do you like that new car?
B. 17-ADR-0002: A petition seeking a Historic Landmark Designation for the property commonly known as 4836 Middaugh Avenue, Downers Grove, IL (PIN 09-07-211-015). The property is located at the northwest corner of Middaugh Avenue and Franklin Street. Patrick and Christine Sexton, Petitioner and Owners. Mr. Williams reviewed the architectural features of this 1893 two-story home, located at Franklin and Middaugh. The home is a Gabled-Ell with Queen Anne characteristics. A photo of the original home was depicted, with staff noting the projecting gables facing each street and the Queen Anne characteristics, i.e., steep pitched roofs, wood clapboard, wood bargeboard and elaborate porches with spindle work.

Per the Historical Society, the home’s first family was the Chilvers family from 1893 to 1898 and Mr. Chilvers was known to be a volunteer fireman on the first Northern Volunteer Fire Brigade and was a trustee who publicly voted down a pay raise requested by a policeman. He was also scammed by a “gold finding machine.”

Photos of the current home were depicted on the overhead with Mr. Williams pointing out the projected gables, the screen porch (dating from 1900s), the original stone foundation with a wheel (design feature), wood scaling at the peak and double-hung windows. He noted that a particular feature he was able to photograph on-site included the second-story corner windows with cornice brackets, which was a unique feature. Another picture reflected the new portion of the home, dating from the 1930s. Mr. Williams shared photos of the home’s interior – the original fire place including original decorative tile, wood etching around a doorway, and the corner window from the interior’s perspective.

Staff recommended approval for landmarking since the structure and addition were more than 50 years old and the architectural style was Gabled-Ell with Queen Anne characteristics.

Chairman Pro tem Larson added that the home is located on a brick street and he enjoyed the interesting Halloween themes that the owners put on display. He found the building interesting, specifically with the wrap-around porch. The home was well maintained.

Petitioner, Ms. Chris Gumm Sexton thanked Cindy Zeski (historical society) who helped her with the home’s research. She shared that she and her husband lived in the home since 1983 but in 1989 she noticed a woman in a car that would park by her house. She came to find that the woman in the car stated her grandfather built the home and his last name was Winter. The woman also lived in the home with her grandparents when she was a child. Ms. Sexton invited the woman into her home who provided some background on the home, such as the back of the home was an addition and the kitchen was not there but there was the dining room, living room and the parlor (with fireplace) and that the upstairs had remained the same in the front.

Ms. Sexton stated the woman started corresponding with her in 1989 and gave her much information about her grandparents and that her grandfather had built the home. However, through research, it was determined he had purchased the home in 1903 and lived there after the Chilvers. Originally, she thought it was the Winters’ home. Ms. Sexton shared that the woman’s correspondence discussed the wonderful memories she had in the home as a child and sent her old photographs of the home as well as photos of her grandparents and extended family. Ms. Sexton asked whether it was required to call the home the Chilvers home when, in her mind, it was the Winters House since the Chilvers built it but only lived in the home for five years, whereas, the Winters spent time in the home from 1898 to 1944, until the owner’s death.
With regard to the name, Ms. Chalberg explained that from the Historical Society’s perspective, the society preferred to have the original owners or builder as the name of the house. However, the village could choose to do it differently. Regarding the letters, Ms. Chalberg suggested holding onto the originals, or, place them in a file permanently with the museum where files were kept on landmarked homes.

Regarding the fireplace, Ms. Sexton stated it was grandiose with its relief pictures and pastoral scene and, after some research, she found the tile was created by William Galimore for Trent Tiles of Trenton, New Jersey, where the company produced such relief tiles from 1890 to 1910. She elaborated how beautiful the fireplace tile really was. As to the corners of the home facing Franklin and Midaugh, Ms. Sexton reported there was some work that still needed to be done on a half wheel configuration and they were in the process of doing that work. She wanted to fix that prior in hopes to not come before the board. However, Ms. Leitschuh explained that she would need a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the work.

In discussing the corner detail, Ms. Sexton believed the detail was original. She explained that in the fret work there were holes in it that indicated to her there were some form of dowel rods to hold the detail. Someone pointed out that it could be somewhat seen in the original house photograph. Because it was a change to the home’s exterior, Ms. Leitschuh stated that Ms. Sexton would have to return to the board.

Lastly, Ms. Sexton provided some personal comments about the Cashell (phonetic) homes that were being constructed next to her property.

Mr. Reimer appreciated the additional historical information and photos provided by the petitioner. He supported scanning the letters and them being part of the record. However, per staff, a permanent paper file and digital file of the material submitted with the application was kept.

Asked if Mr. Winter was a trained engineer, Ms. Sexton reminded the board that when the woman moved there she was 4 or 6 years old and was basing it off of that recollection. She also said her grandfather participated in the construction of the train station but Ms. Sexton had no knowledge of that. Ms. Leitschuh clarified for Ms. Sexton that she will choose the wording for her landmarking plaque. Again, Ms. Sexton asked for board input, recalling that the woman was so passionate about the home that she wanted to give the Winter family credit.

Board member suggestions included having a different plaque for the Chilvers family or having both names on the plaque using a hyphen.

Ms. Cindy Zeski, 1130 Franklin St. recommended the home for landmarking status since it was “a gem” amongst a very changing street. It was a “wonderful gift the owners were giving the village.” Ms. Zeski provided a brief history about the Chilvers family who arrived in the early 1800s and lived in Barbers Corners for a bit, which was Bolingbrook. The Chilvers moved to Downers Grove and Mr. Chilvers constructed many homes in the village. The Chilvers then moved from this home to a corner home on Saratoga, where Mrs. Chilvers lived until she died. The Chilvers’ son also lived on Midaugh, and possibly built the prairie-style home a block down. Ms. Zelski also shared the story about the policeman in more detail. Ms. Zeski, personally felt that the Chilvers may have hired Mr. Winters to work for him which was why the woman may have thought her grandfather built the home because he was a woodworker and
Chilvers constructed homes. Per Zeski, Mr. Winters may have rented the home for a while from Chilvers. As for the train station, Ms. Zeski also shared some insight into the letter that was written by the woman.

Ms. Christine Martin, 701 Maple Ave. also has a landmarked home and was thrilled the owners were landmarking their beautiful home. She felt it was important due to the rapid changes occurring in neighborhoods now. She supported naming it the Winters House.

Ms. Amy Gassen, 5320 Benton Ave., thanked the Sextons for making the decision to landmark their home and protecting it for the future. She noted their home was recently recognized by the Downers Grove Historical Society and Museum’s Historic Home program. Last comments were that while the historical society preferred the original owner’s name to be on the plaque, Ms. Gassen explained there were exceptions, including the name she used for her own home. She also recommended that the owners put “circa” on their plaque unless there is a definitive document stating when the home was constructed. Lastly, she supported all of the research and documentation that was done on the home but stated that type of information was not required for landmarking a home.

Mr. Rich Kulovaney, 6825 Camden, for Friends of the Edwards House, commended the Sextons for seeking landmarking designation and preserving the home for future generations. He loved the history that came out during these meetings and agreed it was not required to prove the exact date of a home, just that it was 50 or more years old. Finally, he added that with the new Historic Preservation Ordinance, homeowners were free to rehab the interiors of their home. He explained the reasons windows and doors were included in the ordinance was because they were more complex and human intervention was necessary. He asked the board to consider the request.

MR. LERNER MADE A MOTION THAT THE ADRB FORWARD A POSITIVE RECOMMENDATION TO THE VILLAGE COUNCIL TO RECOMMEND HISTORICAL LANDMARK DESIGNATION FOR 4836 MIDDAUGH AVENUE.

MR. RIEMER SECONDED THE MOTION. ROLL CALL:

AYE: MR. LERNER, MR. REIMER, MS. CHALBERG, MR. LARSON
NAY: NONE

MOTION CARRIED. VOTE: 4-0